

# Honor Council

H A V E R F O R D C O L L E G E

Vincent and Julius Abstract Discussion Minutes from November 4, 2010

---

**Members Present:**

**Members Absent:**

**Guests:**

1. Moment of Silence
2. Introductions
3. Read Abstract
4. Discussion:
  5. Hilary: I really liked the resolutions, I think they were appropriate. I really like the one about Honor Council writing the letter to Honor Council
  6. Anna: I felt they were a bit harsh. This seems a lot more like collaboration...
  7. \*Alex Tonsing passes by "Alex's primary source seems racist in all the right ways\*
  8. Hilary: I think it was more like plagiarism
  9. Jacob: What a writing center person would do is so drastically different than what we saw Marnie doing
  10. Anna: How so?
  11. Jacob: Marnie took it upon herself to do the work. You have to have the sense that when someone else is writing paragraphs for you, that that's not your work. Whether you make the connection to "plagiarism" is another story. But I think they should have had a sense that they were not producing their own work.
  12. Anna: 0 is too harsh. It's not great but it's not too far out of the range of acceptable collaboration. For someone who hasn't thought a lot about what acceptable collaboration is, it seems too harsh
  13. Jacob: Did Odin and Thor get 0's on that assignment?
  14. Anna: Yes but their assignments were worth nothing.
  15. Odin and Thor background: 2 guys had collaborated too much on a math assignment and got taken to Honor Council.
  16. Phil: If Honor Council says they should get a 0 does the teacher have to go with that?
  17. Anna: No but they tend to...
  18. Jacob: And that might factor into their major grade too
  19. Hilary: Is it because it wasn't intentional?
  20. Anna: I think it's the fact that "I asked you for help" because I had this idea that I didn't know what I was doing and somehow it ended up you giving me a little more help than was appropriate, and I failed the assignment.
  21. Hilary: \*reference to the conversation last night\* in their grade, I think it would have been different if Marnie had been there and been accountable as well.
  22. Phil: I definitely think it would have been different if she was in the community but I don't know how different...

These minutes reflect the opinions of Hilary "Would Take Notes on an iPad" Schwartz and Alex "Doesn't Have A Nickname" Tonsing, the Council co-secretaries (hschwartz@hc or atonsing@hc) and are neither approved nor reviewed by the rest of Council. Questions / comments? Email [code@hc!](mailto:code@hc!)

23. Anna: I can see what you mean, that maybe they're getting blamed for something she did as well...
24. Hilary: or that there was a miscommunication...
25. Anna: But I think the biggest thing is what message does this send to people who need help?
26. Phil: They mention the writing center at the end.
27. Hilary: Peer editing is a normal thing but you know not to add an entire paragraph
28. Anna: But what about a sentence...
29. Hilary: But this isn't just a sentence. And its the same paragraph.
30. Jacob: I also feel like at some point they're being reprimanded for not having enough confidence in their writing...
31. Is that something that they should try to accomplish? I felt like that wasn't the place. I think the professor should have tried to deal with that separately. Resolutions are not the place.
32. Anna: There are some people who function really well and there are a lot of people who just kind of self-depricate themselves and this is a hard environment for those kind of people to come into. People here are smart and if you're constantly comparing yourself to people around you, that's not going to be healthy. How would this affect a normal individual v someone who's self-depricating?
33. \*TRUE LIFE: HONOR COUNCIL\*
34. Hilary: I feel like the twins thing should have been changed...
35. Jacob: The relationship that they had came into play. That they chose to live together and had the same high school friend. It would have come across differently if that hadn't been involved
36. Anna: What if they were just two friends who had gone to the same high school and had come to Haverford?
37. Jacob: I don't think under any circumstances, at least not for a case of this level, would that have been appropriate? I feel like I would read this and feel differently about that question if they weren't related. It makes a difference to me. And I don't know why.
38. Anna: I think I agree with you but I can't articulate it...
39. Phil: Yeah
40. Jacob: To say to two family members, it can be so destabilizing in away that its saying your highschool friend, you and them should live apart for a semester. It seems like it could be very destabilizing in this case. I could be convinced that it would be the same situation for people who were best friends but I would need to be convinced.
41. \*VISITORS =)\*
42. Elizabeth: I think it's weird that they even addressed the possible co-dependency of these two.
43. Anna: Do you think they should have addressed it?
44. Elizabeth: No. If there's co-dependency, addressing it separately is fine, but this was an inappropriate venue. I think it's perfectly possible to live someone and take the same classes and not plagiarize.
45. Phil: Do you think it should be looked into if it affected the plagiarism?

46. Elizabeth: Not unless the codependence was an issue...
47. Elizabeth: I'd be curious to know why one of them responded to Maude's essay and one of them wrote a research paper on an essay.
48. Elizabeth: I like the writing center one.
49. It seems like Vincent sort of took the brunt of all the writing responsibilities. Julius wrote a letter to the community, Vincent wrote a letter and a paper. What does it exactly mean for them to continue to consider the resource?
50. Elizabeth: You have to go once, but they encourage you to go more.
51. Elizabeth: What does Honor Council do if the action results from sort of mental issue? Would they refer it to a psychologist?
52. Anna: It would definitely be taken into account if the person brought it up. There would be something that would be considered somehow- either a psychological review taken into consideration with the resolutions.
53. Eli: I think a 0 was too harsh
54. Noah joins.
55. II End official discussion with a moment of silence.